

## **Rapporteur's Report**

### **Track 2: Labor and Social Movements Responding to Globalization**

Dong-One Kim, Korea University, Seoul, Korea

#### Introduction

The 37 papers selected for presentation in Track 2's plenary session and 7 workshops represent well the current trend of academic and practical interests surrounding labor and social movements around the world. Although it took much longer than I expected, I truly enjoyed reading the papers. The papers in Track 2 can be classified into 6 areas: (1) labor and state, (2) non-standard and socially disadvantaged workers, (3) employee participation in managerial decision-making, (4) trade unions, (5) union renewal and revitalization, and (6) diversity in national IR systems. Papers in Track 2 cover many countries in different continents: Europe, America, Asia, Africa, and Australia. In these papers, one can feel the profound impacts of the 2008 financial crisis on working lives of ordinary people, which still has lingering effects in many countries. Due to the large number of papers, it would be impossible and possibly even uninteresting to mention all of the individual papers. Thus, I chose to mention only a sample of the papers that in my opinion illustrated the main themes of Track 2.

In terms of research methodology, diverse research methods were utilized from multi-variate statistical analyses to legal discussions. Of the 29 papers mentioned in this report, there are 3 multi-variate statistical studies, 2 fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analyses (fsQCA), 2 legal discussions, 4 studies conducted surveys, and 18 single- or multi-case studies based mainly upon interviews and literature review. Thus, qualitative research methods are clearly the majority, whereas a handful of studies relied on multi-variate statistical analyses. Although there has been a general impression that research methodology in IR is moving from traditional qualitative methods to sophisticated quantitative analyses (Whitfield and Strauss, 2000), that is not the case for the papers in Track 2, which are more oriented towards policy and story-telling.

#### Dominant Themes

I will go over 6 main themes of Track 2 one by one.

## 1. Labor and state:

Five papers devoted their attention to the relationships between the state and labor. The first two papers (*Kelly et al.* and *Brandl*) provided rather unexpected and remarkable findings. In their plenary paper, *Kelly et al.* applied political science reasoning to industrial relations outcomes. They analyzed the increasing number of general strikes against governmental policies and policy reforms in 11 Western European countries since 1980s and the successes of unions in gaining concessions from governments in response to general strikes. These are indeed remarkable developments since they occurred simultaneously with decreasing union density and the dominance of neo-liberal economic policies. Using data from the EIRR and EIRO sources on 68 general strikes and strike threats between 1980 and 2006, they estimated by ordered logit models. The study suggests that whereas union power may have declined in relation to employers, the same might not be true of union-government relations. These findings recall the “method displacement” hypothesis (Gall and Hebdon, 2008): when workers are less able to express their grievance in one way (such as strikes against employers at workplaces), there is likely to be a relative growth in the expression of grievances by other means (such as general strikes against the government). Interestingly enough, this is the only paper dealing with strikes in Track 2, which might reflect the declining trend of strike activities in most market economies.

*Brandl* also showed extraordinary results. The paper assesses the impact of tripartite social pacts on the political legitimacy of governments. Utilizing time-series cross-sectional (TSCS) analyses on data from 20 countries during 1980 to 2003, the study showed that, contrary to general belief, social pacts offer no superior electoral performance for governments. While superior electoral performance is nevertheless highlighted in literature as the reason why governments resort to pacts, the findings of *Brandl* clearly demonstrate that political success (i.e. increasing legitimacy of governments) was not realized, despite the common belief.

The next two papers dealt with complex interactions between political democratization and labor movement, one of the traditional research issues in the analysis of macro-level long-term labor movement in developing countries (Kim and Kim, 2003). Whereas *Collins and Sitalaksmi* describes the process of how political democratization influenced labor movement, *Maree* tackles the issues the other way around and focuses on

how labor movement made contributions to political democratization. These contrasting approaches indeed indicate the complex relationship between democratization and labor movement, and the difficulty in defining the causal chains between the two.

*Collins and Sitalaksmi* investigate the political transformation processes and labor movement paths in Indonesia and Vietnam. The paper uses four state-owned enterprises (SOEs) as case studies in both countries. In Indonesia, with the economic and political reforms since the Asian crisis, trade unions at both the national and enterprise levels began to claim greater autonomy and more significant representative roles, whereas in Vietnam this process is still slower and unions were still under the control of the government. The study found that new strategic actors (e.g., management and the trade unions) are claiming more significant roles in Indonesia than in Vietnam.

On the other hand, *Maree* analyzed the role of trade unions in defending and promoting democracy through a comparative study of 8 Sub-Saharan African countries. According to *Maree*, trade unions have played an important role in the transition to as well as the consolidation of democracy in a few African countries (i.e., Ghana and Zambia), whereas there are authoritarian countries where trade unions are working hard to achieve a democratic transformation (i.e., Nigeria, Kenya and Namibia). Sub-Saharan African countries seem to be on the same stage of political and industrial democratization as East Asian countries such as Korea and Taiwan in the 1980s. Trade unions in Sub-Saharan Africa have contributed to the consolidation of democracy in cases where they retained an autonomous power base and the state was not completely oppressive.

There is only one paper dealing with conflict resolution in Track 2. *Ibsen* attempts to explain the variety of third party intervention such as conciliation, mediation and arbitration (CMA) across 17 Western European countries using the fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA) method, which is appropriate for such studies with a limited number of cases. The extended version of Elvander's hypotheses that the absence of strong union centralization/coordination will lead to strong CMAs was tested and generally supported. The paper indicates that the concept of conflict regulation systems is multi-dimensional and should allow for functional equivalents across specific national institutional configurations.

Author(s)	Main theme	Research setting	Methodology	Results / Findings
Kelly et al.	The incidence and outcomes of general	11 Western	Ordered logit model of 68	While union power may have declined in relation

	strikes in Western Europe.	European countries	general strikes between 1980 and 2006	to employers, unions were successful in gaining concessions from governments through an increasing number of general strikes
Collins and Sitalaksmi	Democratization, economic development and the evolution of labor movement.	Indonesia and Vietnam	Interviews	In Indonesia, the economic and political reforms stimulated labor movements, while Vietnam has not experienced the same mode of unions reform
Maree	Role of African unions in promoting democracy	8 Sub-Saharan African countries	Comparative, qualitative study of 8 Sub-Saharan African countries	Unions in Sub-Saharan Africa have contributed to the consolidation of democracy in cases where they retained a strong autonomous power base and the state had not become completely authoritarian
Brandl	The impact of social pacts on electoral outcomes	20 OECD member countries	Panel analyses on the data for 20 countries from 1980 to 2003	Social pacts did not offer any superior electoral performance for governments
Ibsen	Analysis of the variety of third party intervention in Europe	17 Western European countries	Fuzzy-set qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA) method	The absence of strong union centralization led to strong third party intervention along with some other conditions

## 2. Non-standard and socially disadvantaged workers

In Track 2, five papers addressed the issue of non-standard and socially disadvantaged workers, a group that has continued to grow in most countries. These papers deal with the following groups of non-standard and atypical workers: directly hired temporary workers (*Liu, Benassi and Vlandas*); indirectly hired contract workers (*Sundar*); illegal migrant workers (*Selberg*); and disabled workers (*Basas*).

*Liu's* plenary paper applied the corporate governance theory to non-standard workers in an attempt to connect the pressure from financial markets to the changing nature of employment relationships. Based on a quasi-maximum likelihood estimation of 102 establishments in China, publicly listed enterprises were found to make a significantly greater use of temporary employment contracts than non-listed ones. NASDAQ-listed enterprises and those listed on Chinese stock exchanges are associated with a significantly lower use of temporary employment contracts than enterprises listed on the NYSE. This paper, using a rigorously conducted empirical test based upon interdisciplinary theoretical reasoning, shows that the diffusion of non-standard workers was influenced by not only labor market conditions and but also capital market pressures.

The next two papers show the importance of institutional environments (i.e., the role of unions) in protecting non-standard workers. *Benassi and Vlandas* addressed the issue of union inclusiveness regarding union strategies towards temporary workers. Fuzzy-sets qualitative comparative analysis (fsQCA) was used due to the limited number of cases (14 countries). High bargaining coverage proved to be a necessary condition for union inclusiveness in all cases. This shows that institutional embeddedness is a crucial determinant of the ability of unions to undertake inclusive strategies towards temporary workers.

Based on 30 collective agreements concerning contract workers, *Sundar* demonstrates that employers have shifted their employment strategy from directly employing temporary workers to employing workers through intermediaries, known as “contract labor” in India. After extensive descriptions on union efforts, the study sadly came to the conclusion that the various efforts of trade unions to protect these contract workers have not been very effective. This paper indicates that employment and working conditions of the contract workers can be improved under the following institutional conditions: organizing the contract workers; solidarity between regular and contract workers; and the availability of legal and financial resources.

The last two papers dealt with other types of socially disadvantaged groups, such as migrant workers and disabled employees, through the lens of labor law. *Selberg* expressed a humane and progressive view toward undocumented migrant workers (UMW) in Sweden using a legal approach. The existence of 31,000 – 75,000 UMWs living precariously and performing underpaid labor outside the protection of the unions, challenged the representation of Sweden as a generous welfare state. The LO for a long time took the state's migration law view on undocumented migrant workers – illegal aliens – and did not consider

them workers. Recently, however, the LO established the Center to organize undocumented workers, constituting a significant shift in its strategy. But the Swedish government still considers unauthorized work as a crime in Sweden. The author argued for a need to re-define an industrial citizenship, without regard to citizenship in the migration law sense.

Through a legal analysis of collective bargaining agreements, *Basas* examines how collective bargaining agreements frame disability and what conceptual models are used with regards to disabled workers in public sector unionized workplaces. This study used a random sample of 100 collective bargaining agreements in AFSCME’s database of over 7,000 current contracts in the U.S. Using a systematic and inductive approach, the author identified 4 types of disability clauses: industrialist, community stakeholder, compliance officer, and idealist. The study provides a conceptual basis for future empirical studies that may examine the antecedents and correlations of these four types.

Author(s)	Main theme	Research setting	Methodology	Main results / Findings
Liu	The relationship between capital markets and the adoption of temporary employment	China	Quasi-maximum likelihood estimation of 102 establishments	Publicly listed enterprises make significantly greater use of temporary employment contracts than non-listed ones
Benassi and Vlandas	Union inclusiveness strategies towards temporary workers	Europe	Fuzzy-sets qualitative comparative analysis of 14 countries	High bargaining coverage is a necessary condition for union inclusiveness
Sundar	How to improve working conditions of the contract workers	India	Archival records and interviews	The employment and working conditions of the contract workers can be improved only if institutional conditions are met
Selberg	Legal approach to undocumented migrant workers	Sweden	Legal and theoretical analysis	Industrial citizenship , must be redeveloped and redefined without regard to citizenship in the migration law sense
Basas	Typologies of disability clauses in CBAs	U.S.A.	Legal analysis of 100 CBAs	Identified 4 types of disability clauses: industrialist,

				community stakeholder, compliance officer, and idealist
--	--	--	--	---

### 3. Employee Participation in Managerial Decision-Making

Three papers address employee participation issues. *Johnson* explores the origins and outcomes of an unprecedented union-management partnership in the implementation of teachers' performance in the New South Wales (NSW) Department of Education and Communities. The 2000 Teacher Efficiency Agreement (TEA) represented a significant departure from the previous adversarialism. The author argued that the ability of either party to make strategic choices reflects the degree of power available to the other.

Not all employee involvement schemes, however, turned out to be harmonious. *Caraker et al.* described the tension between new public management and co-determination in Denmark during a time of economic crisis. The survey results from 7600 union members in Denmark showed that the codetermination system was affected by the advent of the financial crisis in 2008. The management strategies had taken a turn towards more "management" and less co-determination by bypassing the elected employee representatives, whereas union members seek to reinforce and strengthen co-determination. The 2008 financial crisis certainly had a deep impact in all aspects of labor-management relations including co-determination.

The next paper shows evidence supporting the persistent divergence thesis by describing a unique employee involvement system in Italy. According to *Tiraboschi and Tomassetti*, bilateralism has been increasingly regarded as the new frontier for the rebirth of industrial relations in Italy. Bilateral bodies were instruments for the joint administration of financial resources collected by employers' associations and trade unions for the allocation of benefits in some critical circumstances such as occupational injuries. After the enforcement of the Biagi Law in 2003, the Italian legislator entrusted the bilateral bodies with more powers and bilateralism has been increasing. However, a question remains: (1) Is bilateralism a "Trojan horse" to substitute the role of trade unions by downplaying the role of collective bargaining, or (2) Can unions and bilateral bodies strengthen each other by maintaining a complementary relationship?

Author(s)	Main theme	Research setting	Methodology	Main results / Findings
Tiraboschi and Tomassetti	Bilateralism in Italy	Italy	Literature review and interviews	Bilateralism has increasingly been regarded as the renewed IR in Italy, and unions and bilateral bodies can have a complementary relationship.
Johnson	Union-management partnership in the schooling system	Australia	Case study based upon interviews	The ability of either party to make strategic choices reflects the degree of power available to the other
Caraker et al.	Tension between management control and co-determination during a time of economic crisis	Denmark	Survey questionnaires from 7600 union members	Since the financial crisis in 2008, management strategies have taken a turn towards less co-determination, while union members seek to reinforce and strengthen co-determination

#### 4. Trade unions

Six papers conducted research on various aspects of trade unions. While, the trade union has been a traditional research object in industrial relations literature, these six papers mostly focus on newly developed phenomena in trade unionism such as union mergers, new trends in union administration, network strategies of trade unionism, unionism as a social movement, and alternative forms of trade unions.

*Behrens and Pekarek* systematically compared 3 industrial relations theories - John Kelly's mobilization theory, Richard Hyman's work on union identity, and the behavioral theory of labor negotiations by Walton and McKersie - to seek a theoretical tool for explaining union mergers. The authors tested the three theories using two union merger cases drawn from Germany. The study by Walton and McKersie was found to be more useful than the other theories. It was also discovered that all four subprocesses of bargaining (distributive,

integrative, and inter-organization bargaining, as well as attitudinal structuring) interact with each other. It is surprising that cases of failed merger negotiations outnumbered those of successful ones by more than 2:1. More thorough research is certainly needed in this area.

Utilizing four surveys in 1990, 1993, 2010, and 2011, *Clark et al.* looked at the administrative policies and practices of American and British unions during the 1990-2011 period. The surveys focused on individual union policies and practices involving human resources, hiring, budgeting, and strategic planning. Both in the U.S. and U.K. the majority of unions moved towards more formal and systematic administrative practices, showing how American and British unions are seeking ways to become more effective and efficient. It is apparent that unions are asked to do more with less in the time of union decline.

After providing a rich literature review on the network theory, *Fichter and Sydow* formulated a typology of unions. Using four union cases in Europe, the authors distinguished TNC-centered networks (i.e., unions and networks) from GUF-centered networks (i.e., unions as networks). The article indicates that unions are eager to utilize their networks more than ever to deal with expanding transnational corporations. While there is much research on inter-firm networks, few studies attempt to analyze unions through the network concept. This paper is an attempt to apply network theory to transnational unionism, and provides a theoretical basis for future empirical studies.

As *Kirton and Healy* exemplifies, social movement theory has increasingly influenced IR research in the sociological tradition, especially in the cases of union revitalization and mobilization. This article tries to examine the dynamics and politics of women union leaders' long-term participation in a period of decline, based upon data from a two-year (2008-2010) cross-national (UK/USA) research project involving 134 women union leaders in interviews and small focus groups. One particularly interesting finding is that American and British women seemed to privilege class or union identity over gender identity. They also found evidence of a strong gender identity among union women, but not necessarily a progressive, feminist one. More insights could be obtained through multivariate analyses.

The last two papers show that labor movements are increasingly taking diverse forms in attempts to overcome current membership decline, such as yellow unions in Denmark and occupational unions in Germany. *Ilsoe* showed that yellow unions in Denmark have been one of the examples. Yellow unions offer workers individual legal assistance but rarely negotiate collective agreements and are much cheaper to join than traditional unions. In Denmark, the

membership of yellow unions rapidly increased from 3% of all union members in 1995 to 10% in 2010. Based upon 2 exploratory case studies, the paper focuses on the workplace relations between shop stewards and workers who joined the yellow unions. Another stimulating research question might be the institutional and situational backgrounds for the rise of yellow unions. Comparative study on yellow unions in various countries would also absorb widespread interests.

In their plenary paper, *Greef and Schroeder* document the unexpected rise of occupational unions in Germany where a unified and sectoral unionism under the leadership of the DGB has been dominant. Indeed, over the last ten years, individual trade associations have decided to transform themselves into unions. Utilizing three comparative case studies (unions for pilots, physicians, and train drivers), this study analyzed the process of the advent of independent occupational unions based upon the concept of opportunity-framework. This phenomenon can be certainly considered as another example of collective bargaining decentralization. The authors, however, conclude that a change of the entire German system of industrial relations is far from likely, since professional associations in other sectors did not seem to follow this path. It remains to be seen whether these new experiments of labor movement are a sign of union revitalization, which is the next stream of research in Track 2.

Author(s)	Main theme	Research setting	Methodology	Main results / Findings
Fichter and Sydow	Networks and Unions	Europe	4 union cases	Formulated typologies of union networks
Behrens and Pekarek	Search for theoretical tools explaining union mergers	Germany	Two union cases	Identified some applicable logics to explain union mergers
Clark et al.	Administrative practices of unions	The U.S. and the U.K.	Surveys	Unions are moving towards more formal and systematic administrative practices
Kirton and Healy	Dynamics of women union leaders' long-term participation	The U.S. and the U.K.	134 interviews	American and British women tend to privilege class or union identity over gender identity
Ilsøe	Shop stewards attitudes towards yellow unions	Denmark	2 exploratory case studies	Shop stewards consciously used push and pull strategies toward members of yellow unions
Greef and	The advent of	Germany	Three comparative	Analyzed the process of

Schroeder	occupational unions in Germany		case studies (Pilots, physicians, and train drivers)	how three occupational associations transformed themselves into independent occupational unions
-----------	--------------------------------	--	--	---

## 5. Union renewal and revitalization

The next 7 papers tackled the issue of union renewal and revitalization, one of the most popular research issues in this time of union decline. Most of them stressed the importance of institutional supports from the unions and the state. It seems an ironic point that institutional supports are desperately needed in many areas, considering the present circumstance of persistent union decline.

The first two papers dealt with the cases of organizing young workers. Both of them are descriptive and policy-oriented pieces. *Boris* documents the AFL-CIO Next Up program focusing on young worker groups and examined how they relate to the larger labor movement. *Hodder* also analyzes the relationship between trade unions and young workers, examining the Young Members' Network (YMN) of the Public and Commercial Services union (PCS) in the UK. Both authors seemed to regard these programs as rather successful, possibly due to the resources and supports provided by the AFL-CIO and the PCS.

*Haipeter* documents the effectiveness of revitalization strategies and campaigns of the IGMetall in Germany, using 16 cases of "better not cheaper" campaign regarding works councils. Through an extensive and historical review on the labor relations at plant level, the author observes that the "better not cheaper" campaign was effective in diffusing a practice of strategic codetermination of works councils, which before has existed only in some large plants.

*Jenkins* records the unusual success story of union formation by female garment workers in India. Using live and realistic quotations, the paper documents the process of union organizing by overcoming extreme employer depression against unionism. It is remarkable that the birth and growth of the union was accomplished by extraordinary endeavors and efforts by workers with little support of national and international unions. The author argued that "national and international unions may have become too concerned with 'grand campaigns' to be truly focused on the value of the painstaking work of grass roots organization."

The next two papers deal with “not very successful” cases. *Sarkar et al.* describes an unsuccessful attempt to organize unorganized workers in India who were deprived of some of the basic rights for livelihood and quality of work life. According to authors, the main reasons for the unsuccessful outcome include a low level of education among the workforce and discontinuities in union effort. The authors emphasized the need to establish a coordination mechanism between the government and the trade union in order to address adequately the problems of the workers in the unorganized sector.

In a similar vein, *Agtas and Sayim* reported 3 cases from Turkey focusing on the role of various actors in the implementation of IFAs (International Framework Agreements) at subsidiaries and suppliers. The authors concluded that IFAs had not been very effective so far due to the unwillingness of corporate headquarters to extend IFAs to subsidiaries and suppliers. One reason for the ineffectiveness of IFAs was that international unions such as GUFs (Global Union Federations) could not take on a significant role in implementation at the local level unless they had close relations with national unions.

Finally, the transplant issue is another traditional research agenda in IR, as can be observed in the previous literature regarding applying Japanese managerial systems to American and British environments. *Arnholtz et al.* addresses the transplant issues of IR institutions from the perspective of unionists. Since trade union membership levels in Denmark began to drop considerably from the mid-1990s, LO was trying to import the organizing model (vs. servicing model) into Anglo-Saxon countries. The central research question here is why unions in a high union density country like Denmark chose to import a model from low density countries such as the U.S., the U.K., and Australia. After in-depth interviews with union officials, the author concluded that trying to assess the immediate effects of the organizing model in Denmark seems premature and considerable modifications of the organizing model were needed in order to make the organizing model successful.

Author(s)	Main theme	Research setting	Methodology	Main results / Findings
Boris	The AFL-CIO Next Up program focusing on young worker groups	The U.S.	Interviews focused on 8 young groups	The AFL-CIO needs to maintain a balance between providing support and allowing freedom to the groups

Hodder	The relationship between trade unions and young workers	The U.K.	A case study using interviews and observation	Positive evaluation about the performance of the Young Members Network
Haipeter	Effectiveness of the IGMetall “better not cheaper” campaign	Germany	16 cases of works councils	The “better not cheaper” campaign was effective in diffusing a practice of strategic codetermination of work councils
Arnholtz et al.	Applying the organizing model to the context of Denmark	Denmark	Interviews with union officials	To make the organizing model successful in a Danish environment, considerable modifications are needed
Jenkins	Union Formation by female garment workers in India	India	Interviews	Emphasize the need for grass-roots organizing to be married with strategic thinking about potential constituencies on the part of unions.
Sarkar et al.	Organizing unorganized workers in West Bengal	India	Interviews and simple statistical analysis	Efforts did not turn out to be very successful in organizing unorganized workers, which indicates the need for more active union and government supports
Agtas and Sayim	Implementation of IFAs	Turkey	3 case studies	IFAs have not been very effective due to the unwillingness of corporate headquarters to extend IFAs to subsidiaries and suppliers.

## 6. Diversity in national IR systems

The debate of convergence versus divergence has been one of the oldest and persistent debates in IR (e.g., Katz and Darbishire. 2000), and in this regard Track 2 was not an exception. The overall conclusion from the following three papers seems to be the argument for the persistent divergence. *Kauppinen* reports of the Eurofound research project of a comparative foresight study on industrial relations. The Industrial Relations Foresight

2025 survey respondents from 34 countries had a joint view that liberalism in economic policy will increase as well as atypical employment relations. Job security is also weakening and inequality in incomes is widening by 2025. In the EU they predicted two contradictory trends: in EU 15 member states (the old EU member states) such as the U.K., the Netherlands, France, Italy, there would be a general trend towards lower union density and decentralized collective bargaining, whereas in EU 12 countries (new EU member states) such as Slovenia, Malta, Cyprus and Slovakia one would witness higher union density as well as a move towards sectoral level collective bargaining. The report made a foresight report of increasing divergence and bipolarization of EU 15 member countries and EU 12 countries.

*Holtzhausen* also supported divergence thesis. Whereas collective bargaining is becoming more and more decentralized with a decline in unionism in most market economies, the author observes that unionism was not declining and centralized collective bargaining is still strong in South Africa. This interesting story naturally makes the readers wonder about the reasons for the unique developments in collective bargaining in South Africa.

Comparing the introduction of short-time work in the auto industry in South Africa and Germany, *Seeliger* also reported a case for persistent diversity in that the German case turned out to be much less conflicted than the South African one. The author identifies persisting differences within particular national contexts despite the overwhelming power of globalization, and argued that the different ways of ‘steering through the turbulence’ after the economic crisis have been established by the various car-manufacturers.

Author(s)	Main theme	Research setting	Methodology	Main results / Findings
Kauppinen	Comparative foresight study on industrial relations in 2025	34 countries in Europe	Online survey for gathering expert views	Provide foresight report of increasing divergence between EU 15 member countries and EU 12 countries
Holtzhausen	Industrial relations in South Africa	South Africa	Literature and qualitative study	Unlike other countries, collective bargaining became more of a partnership and remained centralized in South Africa
Seeliger	Comparison of the introduction of short-time work in auto industry	Germany and South Africa	Interviews	The introduction of short-time work in auto industry in Germany turned out to be much

				less conflicted than in South Africa
--	--	--	--	--------------------------------------

Concluding Remarks

I will make two concluding remarks. First, case studies in Track 2 show both successful and unsuccessful attempts at protecting workers and organizing unions. As one can imagine, endeavors backed by strong institutional structures (such as support from robust national unions and federations) in advanced countries were generally proven to be successful. Examples included the Next Up Program of the AFL-CIO in the U.S. (*Boris*), the Young Members’ Network in the U.K. (*Hodder*), and the “better not cheaper” campaign of the IGMetall in Germany (*Haipeter*). On the other hand, when strong institutional structures did not exist or did not assist in forming workers’ organizations and protecting workers’ interests, the attempts were more likely to fail and produced unsuccessful outcomes. Examples included the efforts to extend IFAs to subsidiaries and subcontractors in Turkey (*Agtas and Sayim*), attempts to organize the unorganized sector in West Bengal in India (*Sarkar et al.*), and various efforts of trade unions to protect contract workers in India (*Sundar*). The only exception to this trend might be the Indian case reported by *Jenkins* where workers’ extraordinary efforts overcame employers’ extreme exploitation and succeeded in building their own unions with little outside help. Reading these stories, I wonder naturally if this tendency is leading us to the era of between-country bipolarization or ghetto unionism where trade unions are increasingly confined to traditionally high-density industries and public sector organizations in industrialized countries.

Second, papers in Track 2 generally witnessed or predicted vastly different responses of IR actors to the common challenges that appear to be confronting workforces through the pressure for change over the organization of work and industrial relations, which apparently supports the divergence thesis. Examples include the foresight report of increasing divergence of EU 15 member countries and EU 12 countries (*Kauppinen*), maintaining high union density and centralization of collective bargaining in South Africa (*Holtzhausen*), the different ways of “steering through the turbulences” caused by the economic crisis in South Africa and Germany (*Seeliger*), different trajectories of labor movement after the economic and political reforms since the 1998 Asian crisis in Indonesia and Vietnam (*Collins and Sitalaksmi*), and dissimilar roles of trade unions in promoting democracy in 8 Sub-Saharan

African countries (*Maree*). Although not rigorously tested, the above cases seemed to resemble divergence thesis, rather than convergence thesis.

## References

Blyton, P., N. Bacon, J., Fiorito, and E. Heery, 2008. "Introduction: The Field of Industrial Relations" In Blyton, P., Bacon, N., Fiorito, J., and Heery, E. (Eds.) The Sage Handbook of Industrial Relations, Chapter 1, pp. 1-32, London: SAGE Publication.

Gall, G. and R. Hebdon, 2008. "Conflict at Work" In Blyton, P., Bacon, N., Fiorito, J., and Heery, E. (Eds.) The Sage Handbook of Industrial Relations, Chapter 31, pp. 588-605, London: SAGE Publication.

Gall, G., 2008. "Conflict at Work" In Blyton, P., Bacon, N., Fiorito, J., and Heery, E. (Eds.) The Sage Handbook of Industrial Relations, Chapter 31, pp. 588-605, London: SAGE Publication.

Katz, H. C. and O. Darbishire. 2000. Converging Divergencies. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. Ch. 7 "Summary: Increased Variations within Countries but Similarities across countries."

Kim, D.-O. and S. Kim. 2003. "Globalization, Financial Crisis, and Industrial Relations: The Case of Korea" Industrial Relations Vol. 42. No. 3. pp. 341-367.

Muller-Jentsch, W. 2004. "Chapter 1. Theoretical Approaches to Industrial Relations" In B. E. Kaufman (Eds.) Theoretical Perspectives on Work and the Employment Relationship Champaign, IL: Industrial Relations Research Association, pp. 1-40.

Whitfield, K. and G. Strauss. 2000. "Methods Matter," British Journal of Industrial Relations, 38(1): 141-151.